FILED

10/02/2023

Angle Sparks

Lewis & Clark County District Court
STATE OF MONTANA

By: <u>Denaye Cooper</u>
DV-25-2020-0000307-BF
Seeley, Kathy
420.00

Austin Knudsen

Montana Attorney General

Michael Russell

Thane Johnson

Assistant Attorneys General

MONTANA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

PO Box 201401

Helena, MT 59620-1401

Phone: 406-444-2026

Emily Jones
Special Assistant Attorney General
JONES LAW FIRM, PLLC
115 N. Broadway, Suite 410
Billings, MT 59101
Phone: 406-384-7990
emily@joneslawmt.com

Mark L. Stermitz CROWLEY FLECK, PLLP 305 S. 4th Street E., Suite 100 Missoula, MT 59801-2701 Phone: (406) 523-3600 mstermitz@crowleyfleck.com Attorneys for Defendants Selena Z. Sauer CROWLEY FLECK, PLLP PO Box 759 Kalispell, MT 59903-0759 Phone: 406-752-6644 ssauer@crowleyfleck.com

### MONTANA FIRST JUDICIAL DISTRICT COURT, LEWIS & CLARK COUNTY

RIKKI HELD, et al.,	Cause CDV 2020–307 Hon. Kathy Seeley
Plaintiffs,	Holl. Kathy Seeley
v.	NOTICE OF APPEAL
STATE OF MONTANA, et al.,	
Defendants.	

Notice is given that Defendant State of Montana has filed a Notice of Appeal to the Montana Supreme Court from the following Orders:

1. Order dated August 4, 2021 (Doc. 46) on Defendants' Motion to Dismiss (Doc.

11);

2. Order dated June 30, 2022 (Doc. 158), denying Defendants' Rule 60(a) Motion for

Clarification of Order on State's Motion to Dismiss (Doc. 84);

3. Order dated September 22, 2022 (Doc. 217), denying Defendants' Second Rule

60(a) Motion for Clarification of Order on State's Motion to Dismiss (Doc. 167);

4. Order dated October 14, 2022 (Doc. 225), denying Defendants' Rule 35(a) Motion

for Independent Medical Examination (Doc. 163);

5. Order dated May 23, 2023 (Doc. 379) on Defendants' Motion for Summary

Judgment (Doc. 290);

6. Order dated June 1, 2023 (Doc. 381), ruling on Motions in Limine (Docs. 260, 262,

264, 266, 268, 270, 272);

7. Order dated June 7, 2023 (Doc. 384), denying Defendants' Motion to Dismiss

MEPA Claims (Doc. 376); and

8. Order dated August 14, 2023 (Doc. 405), finding in favor of Plaintiffs on all

remaining claims.

A true and correct copy of the Supreme Court filed and docketed Notice of Appeal (without

attached District Court Orders) is attached as Exhibit A.

DATED this 2nd day of October, 2023.

Austin Knudsen

MONTANA ATTORNEY GENERAL

Michael Russell

Thane Johnson

Assistant Attorneys General

MONTANA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

PO Box 201401

Helena, MT 59620-1401

Emily Jones
Special Assistant Attorney General
JONES LAW FIRM, PLLC
115 N. Broadway, Suite 410
Billings, MT 59101

Mark L. Stermitz CROWLEY FLECK, PLLP 305 S. 4th Street E., Suite 100 Missoula, MT 59801-2701

Selena Z. Sauer CROWLEY FLECK PLLP PO Box 759 Kalispell, MT 59903-0759

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANTS

## FILED

09/28/2023

Bowen Greenwood
CLERK OF THE SUPREME COURT
STATE OF MONTANA

Case Number: DA 23-0575

# IN THE SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF MONTANA No. DA

RIKKI HELD; LANDER B., by and through his guardian Sara Busse; BADGE B., by and through his guardian Sara Busse; SARIEL SANDOVAL; KIAN T., by and through his guardian Todd Tanner; GEORGIANNA FISCHER; KATHRYN GRACE GIBSON-SNYDER; EVA L., by and through her guardian Mark Lighthiser; MIKA K., by and through his guardian Rachel Kantor; OLIVIA VESOVICH; JEFFREY K., by and through his guardian Laura King; NATHANIEL K., by and through his guardian Laura King; CLAIRE VLASES; RUBY D., by and through her guardian Shane Doyle; TALEAH HERNÁNDEZ,

Plaintiffs and Appellees,

v.

STATE OF MONTANA, GOVERNOR GREG GIANFORTE, MONTANA DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY, MONTANA DEPARTMENT OF NATURAL RESOURCES AND CONSERVATION, and MONTANA DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION,

Defendants and Appellants.

On appeal from the Montana First Judicial District Court, Lewis and Clark County Cause No. CDV 2020–307, the Honorable Kathy Seeley, Presiding

### STATE OF MONTANA'S NOTICE OF APPEAL

Austin Knudsen

Montana Attorney General

Michael D. Russell

Thane Johnson

Assistant Attorneys General

MONTANA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE mstermitz@crowleyfleck.com

PO Box 201401

Helena, MT 59620-1401

Phone: 406-444-2026

michael.russell@mt.gov

thane.johnson@mt.gov

**Emily Jones** 

Special Assistant Attorney General

JONES LAW FIRM, PLLC

115 N. Broadway, Suite 410

Billings, MT 59101

Phone: 406-384-7990

emily@joneslawmt.com

Attorneys for Defendant State of Montana

Roger Sullivan **Dustin Leftridge** McGARVEY LAW 345 1st Avenue East Kalispell, TM 59901 Phone: 406-752-5566

rsullivan@mcgarveylaw.com dleftridge@mcgarvevlaw.com

Nathan Bellinger (pro hac vice) Andrea Rodgers (pro hac vice) Julia Olson (pro hac vice)

**OUR CHILDREN'S TRUST** 

1216 Lincon Street

Eugene, OR 97401 Phone 413-687-1668

nate@ourchildrenstrust.org

andrea@ourchildrenstrust.org

julia@ourchildrenstrust.org

Attorneys for Plaintiffs/Appellees

Mark L. Stermitz

CROWLEY FLECK, PLLP

305 S. 4th Street E., Suite 100

Missoula, MT 59801-2701

Phone: 406-523-3600

Selena Z. Sauer

CROWLEY FLECK, PLLP

PO Box 759

Kalispell, MT 59903-0759

Phone: 406-752-6644

ssauer@crowleyfleck.com

Melissa Hornbein Barbara Chillcott WESTERN ENVIRONMENTAL LAW CENTER 103 Reeder's Alley Helena, MT 59601 Phone: 406-708-3058 hornbein@westernlaw.org chillcott@westernlaw.org

Philip L. Gregory (pro hac vice) GREGORY LAW GROUP 1250 Godetia Drive Redwood City, CA 94062 Phone 650-278-2957 pgregory@gregorylawgroup.com Notice is given that State of Montana, a Defendant in Cause No. DV 20–307, First Judicial District, Lewis and Clark County, hereby files this appeal to the Montana Supreme Court from the following Orders:

- 1. Order dated August 4, 2021 (Doc. 46) on Defendants' Motion to Dismiss;
- Order dated June 30, 2022 (Doc. 158), denying Defendants' Rule 60(a)
   Motion for Clarification of Order on State's Motion to Dismiss;
- 3. Order dated September 22, 2022 (Doc. 217), denying Defendants' Second Rule 60(a) Motion for Clarification of Order on State's Motion to Dismiss;
- 4. Order dated October 14, 2022 (Doc. 225), denying Defendants' Rule 35(a) Motion for Independent Medical Examination;
- 5. Order dated May 23, 2023 (Doc. 379) on Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment;
  - 6. Order dated June 1, 2023 (Doc. 381), ruling on Motions in Limine;
- 7. Order dated June 7, 2023 (Doc. 384), denying Defendants' Motion to Dismiss MEPA Claims; and
- 8. Order dated August 14, 2023 (Doc. 405), finding in favor of Plaintiffs on all remaining claims.

## THE APPELLANT FURTHER CERTIFIES:

- 1. That this appeal is not subject to the mediation process required by Mont. R. App. P. 7.
- 2. That this appeal is an appeal from an order certified as final under Mont.

  R. Civ. P. 54(b). A true and correct copy of the Order certifying the above orders as final for purposes of appeal (Doc. 417) is attached.
- 3. That all available transcripts of the proceedings in this case have been ordered from the court reporter contemporaneously with the filing of this notice of appeal.
  - 4. That the Appellant is exempt from filing fee requirements.
- 5. That pursuant to Mont. R. App. P. 4(4)(d) a copy of the Notice of Appeal will be served by mail to the Clerk of the First District Court and counsel of record, as well as via electronic filing.

## DATED this 28th day of September, 2023.

Austin Knudsen
MONTANA ATTORNEY GENERAL

## /s/ Michael Russell

Michael Russell
Thane Johnson
Assistant Attorneys General
PO Box 201401
Helena, MT 59620-1401

Emily Jones
Special Assistant Attorney General
JONES LAW FIRM, PLLC
115 N. Broadway, Suite 410
Billings, MT 59101

Mark L. Stermitz CROWLEY FLECK, PLLP 305 S. 4th Street E., Suite 100 Missoula, MT 59801-2701 Phone: 406-523-3600

Selena Z. Sauer CROWLEY FLECK, PLLP PO Box 759 Kalispell, MT 59903-0759 Phone: 406-752-6644

ATTORNEYS FOR APPELLANT STATE OF MONTANA

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Michael D. Russell, hereby certify that I have served true and accurate copies of the foregoing Notice - Notice of Appeal to Supreme Court to the following on 10-02-2023:

Mark L. Stermitz (Attorney) 304 South 4th St. East Suite 100

Missoula MT 59801

Representing: Mt Dept. Of Natural Resources And Conservation, Montana Department of Environmental Quality, Greg Gianforte, Montana Public Service Commission, Steve Bullock, Montana Department of Transportation, State of Montana

Service Method: eService

Thane P. Johnson (Govt Attorney) 215 N SANDERS ST P.O. Box 201401 HELENA MT 59620-1401 Representing: State of Montana Service Method: eService

Thane P. Johnson (Attorney) 215 N SANDERS ST P.O. Box 201401

HELENA MT 59620-1401

Representing: Mt Dept. Of Natural Resources And Conservation, Montana Department of Environmental Quality, Greg Gianforte, Montana Public Service Commission, Steve Bullock, Montana Department of Transportation, State of Montana

Service Method: eService

Emily Jones (Attorney) 115 North Broadway Suite 410

Billings MT 59101

Representing: Mt Dept. Of Natural Resources And Conservation, Montana Department of Environmental Quality, Greg Gianforte, Montana Public Service Commission, Steve Bullock, Montana Department of Transportation, State of Montana

Service Method: eService

Austin Miles Knudsen (Govt Attorney) 215 N. Sanders

Helena MT 59620

Representing: Mt Dept. Of Natural Resources And Conservation, Greg Gianforte, Montana Public

Service Commission, Steve Bullock, Montana Department of Transportation, State of Montana

Service Method: eService

Melissa Anne Hornbein (Attorney)

103 Reeder's Alley

Helena MT 59601

Representing: Kian T, Eva L, Badge B, Rikki Held, Jeffrey K, Nathaniel K, Olivia V, Lander B,

Kathryn Grace S, Mika K, Georgianna F, Sariel S

Service Method: eService

Dustin Alan Richard Leftridge (Attorney)

345 First Avenue East

Montana

Kalispell MT 59901

Representing: Kian T, Eva L, Badge B, Rikki Held, Jeffrey K, Nathaniel K, Olivia V, Lander B,

Kathryn Grace S, Mika K, Georgianna F, Sariel S

Service Method: eService

Barbara L Chillcott (Attorney)

103 Reeder's Alley

Helena MT 59601

Representing: Kian T, Eva L, Badge B, Rikki Held, Jeffrey K, Nathaniel K, Olivia V, Lander B,

Kathryn Grace S, Mika K, Georgianna F, Sariel S

Service Method: eService

Roger M. Sullivan (Attorney)

345 1st Avenue E

MT

Kalispell MT 59901

Representing: Kian T, Eva L, Badge B, Rikki Held, Jeffrey K, Nathaniel K, Olivia V, Lander B,

Kathryn Grace S, Mika K, Georgianna F, Sariel S

Service Method: eService

Lee M. McKenna (Govt Attorney)

1520 E. Sixth Ave.

HELENA MT 59601-0908

Representing: Montana Department of Environmental Quality

Service Method: eService

Selena Z. Sauer (Attorney)

P. O. Box 759

Kalispell 59903-0759

Representing: Mt Dept. Of Natural Resources And Conservation, Montana Department of Environmental Quality, Greg Gianforte, Montana Public Service Commission, Steve Bullock, Montana

Department of Transportation, State of Montana

Service Method: Email

Electronically signed by Deborah Bungay on behalf of Michael D. Russell Dated: 10-02-2023